

# Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting

DRAFT Key Meeting Outcomes  
Friday, November 20, 2015

Robert J. Lagomarsino Visitor Center at the Channel Islands National Park Headquarters  
1901 Spinnaker Drive · Ventura Harbor, CA

*Note: Upon approval by the council (expected in January 2016), this document will be posted online at [http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/meeting\\_notes.html](http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/meeting_notes.html). Audio recordings of this meeting are available upon request to [Michael.Murray@noaa.gov](mailto:Michael.Murray@noaa.gov).*

## **Administrative Business and Announcements**

The council approved finalization of the Draft Key Outcomes summarizing the September 18, 2015 advisory council meeting. 17 voting seats were represented during the meeting (see attached attendance roster).

### ***Sanctuary Superintendent's Report***

Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent Chris Mobley recognized Channel Islands National Park Superintendent Russell Galipeau and Chief of Natural Resources Management Kate Faulkner for receiving the Stephen T. Mather award from National Parks Conservation Association. He also discussed the status of the sanctuary nomination process, noting that two new national marine sanctuaries are in the designation process. Chris Mobley then welcomed Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Superintendent Paul Michel, and invited him to share a few words about what is happening in MBNMS.

Paul Michel explained that MBNMS started its management plan review process, and sanctuary staff is currently reviewing public scoping comments. In addition, with recent drought conditions, MBNMS has received many desalination project proposals, three of which MBNMS is the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) lead. Paul Michel also mentioned Big Blue Live, a three-day presentation of BBC and PBS that highlighted the wildlife in MBNMS. Finally, Paul Michel spoke about a nine day research cruise that took place in MBNMS where scientists recorded marine mammal and seabird observations, took oceanographic measurements, and explored the use of environmental DNA for monitoring.

### ***Council Member Announcements***

Council members noted that the 9<sup>th</sup> California Islands Symposium is scheduled for October 3-7, 2016 in Ventura, Ca. In addition, a number of council members shared announcements (unrelated to meeting agenda items). Audio recordings are available upon request.

## **Recently Published Results on Channel Islands Marine Reserves Network**

Council research seat member Dr. Robert Warner from the University of California, Santa Barbara, summarized the findings from a paper recently published in Scientific Reports titled *Recovery trajectories of kelp forest animals are rapid yet spatially variable across a network of temperate marine protected areas*<sup>1</sup>. Dr. Warner explained that this report is looking at changes in the Channel Islands marine protected area (MPA) network ten years after implementation in 2003. For this study, Dr. Warner and his colleagues analyzed data from 47 sites that are monitored by Partnership for Interdisciplinary Studies of Coastal Oceans (PISCO). He stated that the overall result is that the biomass of targeted (i.e. fished) species has increased consistently inside all MPAs in the network, with an effect of geography on the strength of response. Dr. Warner also noted that biomass of targeted fish species also increased outside MPAs, although not as rapidly as in the protected areas. Thus, he and his coauthors conclude that there is no evidence that targeted fish species are being depleted outside of MPAs in the Channel Islands due to

---

<sup>1</sup> Caselle, Jennifer E., Andrew Rassweiler, Scott L. Hamilton, and Robert R. Warner. "Recovery Trajectories of Kelp Forest Animals Are Rapid Yet Spatially Variable across a Network of Temperate Marine Protected Areas." *Sci. Rep. Scientific Reports* 5 (2015): 14102. <http://www.nature.com/articles/srep14102>.

displaced fishing effort, which is a commonly cited criticism of MPAs. Dr. Warner noted that whether the increase outside of MPAs is due to changes in fishing pressure, fisheries management actions, adult spillover, favorable environmental conditions, or a combination of all four remains unknown. Finally, Dr. Warner explained that there is no evidence that MPAs were originally placed in either degraded or richer areas compared to non-MPA sites because in every case, the biomass values at the initiation of this study inside MPAs are no different from those outside MPAs.

Dr. Warner fielded council member questions regarding: the relationship between biomass and biodiversity in MPAs; the effect of MPA size on biomass; and the effect of MPAs on non-fish species. In response to questions and concerns raised by the Recreational Fishing seat member Capt. David Bacon about the absence of fishing community involvement with the study, Dr. Warner explained that the studies were set up to provide fishery-independent data, and also were not designed to collect socio-economic data. Dr. Warner also fielded questions about the selection of control sites for the MPA studies, and spoke to the potential effects of colder waters both inside and outside marine reserves. The council discussion went on to touch on a number of points about marine reserves and their study, including concerns about negative effects to recreational fishing activities, interest in the creation of artificial reefs as mitigation for lost fishing areas, the need for a variety of study types to address a range of questions (not expecting that the study Dr. Warner was reporting on could cover all interests), encouragement for council members to join efforts to pursue funding to address MPA-related questions of concern, the value of the marine reserves to non-consumptive recreational businesses as well for members of the general public that value wild places.

### **Public Comment**

Eric Kett, a recreational fisherman and diver, explained that he does not believe that the locations of the control points in the MPA study are representative. He also noted that there are fewer fishing charters now, and so fishing pressure has been reduced.

### **Deep Sea Coral Education Resources**

Julie Bursek, CINMS team lead for Education and Outreach, provided an overview of newly developed and publicly available educational materials (lesson plans, videos, posters, etc.) that highlight deep sea coral communities within CINMS and other west coast sanctuaries. The curriculum is available online: <http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/education/teachers/deep-coral-communities/>. Julie Bursek walked the council through a species identification exercise using video transects recorded by a deep sea remotely operated vehicle (ROV).

A council member asked if teachers require training to use the curriculum, and Julie Bursek explained that the training is included online and the curriculum is designed to be self-sufficient; however, if requested, she could do teacher training workshops with partners. Another council member recommended that additional metadata, such as transect depth, should be added to the online transect videos.

### **Vessel Groundings**

Sean Hastings, CINMS Resource Protection Coordinator, gave an update on recent vessel grounding incidents in the Sanctuary and Park. He explained that there have been six vessel groundings in the Sanctuary in the past two months, and that fortunately no one was injured during any of the incidents. At the time of his update, five of the six vessels had been successfully removed from the Channel Islands. Sean explained that, as per Sanctuary regulations, it is illegal to abandon a vessel in the Sanctuary, so Sanctuary staff works closely with the Park, the Coast Guard, and Vessel Assist to salvage grounded vessels. Sean noted that rapid salvage response is critical as it improves the chance that all debris and materials will be removed. Sean also stated that not every vessel has insurance (especially small vessels), so the responsible party doesn't always have the funding to recover a grounded vessel, which makes it challenging for the Sanctuary and Park. He explained that in cases when the responsible party does not have insurance or adequate funding to cover the vessel salvage, the Sanctuary and Park must decide if they want to use taxpayer money to clean up the debris. Sean then invited CDR Casey Hehr (Coast Guard), Russell Galipeau (Channel Islands National Park), and Capt. Paul Amaral (Vessel Assist of Ventura) to comment on the vessel groundings. CDR Casey Hehr explained that the Coast Guard is usually the first to know when a vessel runs aground. In terms of vessel salvage, the Coast Guard only has legal authority to remove the oil, gas, and any hazardous materials from the vessel. Russell noted that the Park and Sanctuary are an important conservation area, and he recommended that the Council work to find funding to clean up grounded vessels so that they don't

become debris fields. Paul explained that vessel groundings are often due to a mix of sea and weather conditions, human error, and equipment failure. He reiterated that rapid response is important, so the more prepared that Vessel Assist can be to respond is valuable.

Council members raised questions regarding the financial liability placed on vessel owners who run aground. In addition, council members discussed whether boat safety training could help to reduce the frequency of vessel groundings.

### **California Spiny Lobster Fishery Management Plan**

Council member Julia Coates, Environmental Manager with the California Department of Fish and Wildlife's (CDFW) Marine Region, provided an educational presentation on the state's development of a Spiny Lobster Fishery Management Plan. She used slides (available upon request to [julia.coates@wildlife.ca.gov](mailto:julia.coates@wildlife.ca.gov)) that she had prepared for an upcoming presentation to the California Fish and Game Commission. Julia described the process history for development of the draft management plan, and indicated that it would soon be delivered to the Fish and Game Commission for their review, as well as for public review. Julie also described the basic contents of the plan, and explained in more detail three key elements of the plan's proposed Harvest Control Rule: 1) use of three reference points to monitor lobster stock and commercial fishery status; 2) use of a matrix that links reference points to an interpretation of stock health and the need for possible management responses; 3) a toolbox of management tools that could be used to respond. Julia explained how each of the three reference points are derived: catch, catch per unit effort, and spawning potential ratio. In explaining a model that had been developed, and use of a matrix, Julia pointed out that the effects of established marine protected areas will be factored in. Management tools being considered in the draft plan were described by Julia, and included: Change in commercial trap limit; changing recreational bag limits; total allowable catch (TAC); district closures; change in season length; change in minimum size; imposing maximum size; and sex-selective fishery. Julia stepped the council through Lobster Advisory Committee proposals for commercial fishery regulations, which included: trap limits & trap tags; transferable permits (300) & non-transferable permits (300); may stack 2 permits; all traps must be tagged; catastrophic loss > 75 tags; SCUBA equipment; waiver allowing fishing of another's traps; may possess up to 6 traps belonging to another fishermen if lost; increase soak time from 4 to 7 days; and traps may be in water but wired open & unbaited 9 days before & after season. Lobster Advisory Committee regulatory recommendations for the recreational fishery were explained as addressing: tail clipping (hole punch or remove 1/2 central pleopod); season opener 6:00 am instead of 12:00 am; hoop net floats marked with Go ID; "hooked device" provision allows for possession of a spear gun; and mechanized pullers allowed. In addition, Julia explained that CDFW recommendations for regulations would address: traps not retrieved 14 days after season close are considered abandoned; an unlimited number of these may be retrieved by other lobster permit holders; revised commercial logs (GPS locations instead of landmarks, number of traps in water); revised commercial receipts; and gear loss reporting (during and end of season). Julia concluded by explaining the possible timeline for the plan to be completed, indicating the possibility of plan adoption by June 2016. Julia then fielded a variety of questions from council members.

### **Shipping and Whales**

Council member Capt. Kip Louttit from the Marine Exchange of Southern California gave a vessel traffic report for the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach. He explained that ship traffic is shifting back into the Santa Barbara Traffic Separation Scheme, and this may be due to the Emission Control Area (ECA) regulations.

Phyllis Grifman, co-chair of the Marine Shipping Working Group, gave an update on the working group's fourth meeting, which took place in October. Phyllis explained that at this meeting, the working group refined recommendations about outreach, education ideas and research needs. They also discussed the pros and cons of various shipping management options, including seasonal management areas, dynamic management areas, vessel speed reduction, and various routing schemes. Finally, the group collaborated on the development of two multifaceted proposals, which will be refined over the coming months before being recommended to the Sanctuary Advisory Council in a final report. Phyllis noted that the final MSWG meeting will be held on January 7, 2016.

Sean Hastings noted that the seasonal voluntary vessel speed reduction zone in the Santa Barbara Channel was removed in November, and sanctuary staff will be analyzing the ship speed data from the summer to assess levels

of cooperation. In addition, Sean stated that the sanctuary is considering another incentive-based vessel speed reduction trial for the summer of 2016.

### **Channel Islands National Park Scorpion Pier Replacement**

Russell Galipeau, Channel Islands National Park Superintendent, presented on the Park's plans to replace the Scorpion Anchorage Pier. He explained that the Park needs to replace the pier so that it provides safer and easier access for the public and Park staff; provides adequate water depth for concessioner and Park vessels; and meets basic administrative functional requirements. Russell stated that a Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) for the Scorpion Pier Replacement has been drafted and it evaluates the proposed action of replacing and potentially relocating the existing Scorpion Pier at Santa Cruz Island, as well as making improvements to the connecting access road. The Draft EIS analyzes three potential alternatives, and Alternative 2 is the preferred alternative because it will have fewer environmental impacts. Russell also described many details about the three alternatives, which can be found online: <http://parkplanning.nps.gov/projectHome.cfm?projectID=45488>. Russell encouraged the council and members of the public to submit comments on the Draft EIS prior to the deadline on December 18, 2015. He stated that the target dates of construction are November 2017 to May 2018.

### **Public Comment**

Eric Kett, a recreational fisherman and diver, commented that there are boating safety courses for commercial operators that may be useful to help reduce vessel groundings. He also expressed support for the idea of the Channel Islands National Park developing a recreational/private boat landing on Santa Cruz Island as part of efforts to rebuild the pier at Scorpion.

### **Working Group Reports**

- **Research Activities Panel.** Dr. Robert Warner noted that there will be a Research Activities Panel meeting on December 4, 2015.
- **Marketing Subcommittee.** Michael Cohen explained that the Chamber of Commerce received funding from Plains All American to promote recreational and commercial fishing in Santa Barbara. He encouraged council members to reach out if they would like to be involved in this marketing project focused on local fishing and seafood.
- **Sanctuary Education Team.** Cliff Rodrigues noted that the Ocean Science winner of the Ventura County science fair was awarded a trip to the Channel Islands. The next science fair is April 20, 2016.
- **Conservation Working Group** Ben Pitterle noted that the Santa Barbara County MPA Collaborative meeting is on December 9, 2015. In addition, he stated that Santa Barbara Channelkeeper has a boat that can be used to assist with whale disentanglement efforts.
- **Chumash Community Working Group.** Luhui Isha Ward highlighted the successful annual tomol crossing and celebration, and noted that they are interested in having more interactive tomol crossings more regularly along the coast. She also explained that at the end of January there will be a Chumash Eyes on the Water social media campaign, which will include informal outreach about MPAs and Chumash cultural resources related to waterways.
- No reports were provided from the **Channel Islands Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) on Enforcement**, the **Recreational Fishing Working Group**, and the **Commercial Fishing Working Group**.

### **Meeting Close-Out**

The council was reminded that upcoming council meetings in 2016 are scheduled for:

- Friday, January 22 - Santa Barbara
- Friday, March 18 - Ventura
- Friday, May 20 - Santa Barbara
- Friday, July 15 - Oxnard
- Friday, September 16 - Santa Barbara
- Friday, November 18 – Ventura

### **Optional Post-Meeting Session: Graduate Student Mock-Council Discussion Period**

After the official Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting, graduate students enrolled in a Coastal & Ocean Policy and Management course at UCSB's Bren School of Environmental Science and Management conducted a mock council session. Students took on the roles of stakeholders and agency representatives in a discussion about unmanned technology use within the sanctuary.

## Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Attendance Roster (November 20, 2015)

Andrea Mills	Tourism	Present
Garrett Kababik	Tourism - Alternate	Present
Ben Pitterle	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Present
Tony Knight	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Michael Cohen	Business	Present
Capt. Kip Louttit	Business - Alternate	Present
Kristi Birney	Conservation	<i>Absent</i>
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing	<i>Absent</i>
John Hoadley	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Present
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Amanda Allen	Education	<i>Absent</i>
Cliff Rodrigues	Education - Alternate	Present
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	Present
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	Present
Phyllis Grifman	Public At Large #1	Present
Victor Cox	Public At Large #1 - Alternate	Present
Richard Block	Public At Large #2	Present
<i>vacant</i>	Public At Large #2 - Alternate	--
Luhui Isha Ward	Chumash Community	Present
Mati Waiya	Chumash Community - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
<i>vacant</i>	NOAA Fisheries	--
Shelby Mendez	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Russell Galipeau	National Park Service	Present
<i>vacant</i>	National Park Service - Alternate	--
CDR Casey Hehr	US Coast Guard	Present
LT CMDR Joseph Giammanco	US Coast Guard - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Donna Schroeder	BOEM	Present
Dr. Ann Bull	BOEM - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
John Ugoretz	Dept. of Defense	<i>Absent</i>
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	Present
Craig Schulman	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife	<i>Absent</i>
Julia Coates	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife - Alternate	Present
Rich Rozzelle	CA Natural Resources Agency	Present
Amy Vierra	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	<i>Absent</i>
Molly Troup	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dianne Black	Santa Barbara County	Present
Anne Almy	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Danielle Tarr	Ventura County	Present
<i>vacant</i>	Ventura County - Alternate	--
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Present
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	Present
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Maria Brown	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Brian Johnson	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>