

Proposed Grading System for Management Options

Summary

At the June 29, 2015 meeting, the Marine Shipping Working Group (MSWG) reviewed six preliminary management option ideas. Members acknowledged that all address, at some level, one or more of the goals established for the working group's deliberations. In order to gain an overall perspective of how well different management options perform with regard to the four goals of the MSWG, members agreed that a grading or ranking system should be developed for these proposals as well as any new proposed management options to facilitate further discussion toward the ultimate goal of providing working group recommendations. The MSWG delegated a small ad hoc subcommittee composed of working group members and NOAA staff to develop and use an appropriate grading/ranking system.

Ad Hoc Subcommittee Members (volunteers)

The following individuals volunteered to work on this task with the goal of using the grading approach to review the existing options and ultimately develop refined options for working group review before its next meeting. Other MSWG members may still join the subcommittee if desired.

Kristi Birney, Environmental Defense Center

Mary Byrd, SBCAPCD

John Calambokidis, Cascadia Research

TL Garrett, PMSA

Kathy Metcalf, Chamber of Shipping of America

Jessica Redfern, NOAA

Greg Silber, NOAA

Zak Smith, NRDC

John Ugoretz, USN

MSWG Goals

As contained in the January 2014 working group proposal, the goals associated with the development of recommendations to the SAC are as follows:

- 1) Reduce the risk of ship strikes on endangered whales,
- 2) Decrease air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions,
- 3) Improve navigational safety and promote efficient maritime shipping throughout the region, and

- 4) Manage ship traffic to minimize naval operation interruptions and reduce conflicts with other ocean users (e.g. fishing and whale watching concessionaires).

Proposed Grading System for Proposed Management Options

One working group member (Kathy Metcalf of the Chamber of Shipping of America) has worked with MSWG staff and facilitators to recommend the following red-yellow-green ranking system to broadly grade the preliminary management option ideas. The red-yellow-green criteria will be applied to each of the four goals listed above for each preliminary management option idea:

- Red signifies that the proposal has a negative impact on the goal
- Yellow signifies that the proposal does not address a particular goal or has neither a positive nor negative impact on a particular goal
- Green signifies that the proposal has a positive impact on a particular goal

This is a coarse evaluation system that may later need to be refined for a more calibrated evaluation. For example, red might be divided into a 1, 2, or 3 rating; yellow might be divided into a 4, 5, or 6 rating; green might be divided into a 7, 8 or 9 rating. The ad hoc subcommittee will use its discretion on whether to keep the grading broad (red/yellow/green) or more specific (1-9). The chart on the subsequent pages demonstrates how these criteria would be applied.

Preliminary Management Option Ideas to be Evaluated

The first evaluation iteration should focus on 8 specific management options as follows. Options 3 through 8 are options that were created by the MSWG in SeaSketch and were discussed at the June 29th meeting. Option 2 is an additional suggestion raised at the June 29th meeting that was taken from the USCG Port Access Route Study published September 2011.

- 1) Status quo
- 2) Shipping Lane Idea: Establish Western TSS South of the Channel Islands (USCG PARS Study 2011)
- 3) Shipping Lane Idea: Make Voluntary Western Lane an Official TSS
- 4) Shipping Lane Idea: Bathymetric Feature Avoidance
- 5) Seasonal Management Area Idea: VSR Seasonal Inside and Outside Channel
- 6) Dynamic Management Area Idea: AIS Whale Warning Zone
- 7) Multi-part Management Idea: Area of Interest, DMA, SMA & TSS Shipping Lane
- 8) Speed Reduction Zone Idea: VSR

The subcommittee will share its evaluation of these eight management options with the full MSWG for consideration, and all MSWG members will be asked to use these evaluations to inform development of any additional/revised management options. New management options and revisions to these 8 options will then be graded with the same system in an iterative process.

Proposed Grading Matrix

Name of Grader: _____

Goals					
Management Options		Reduce Risk of Ship Strikes	Decrease Air Pollution and GHGs	Improve Navigational Safety and Shipping Efficiency	Minimize naval ops interruptions and other ocean user conflicts
	1) Status Quo				
	2) Shipping Lane: Establish Western TSS South of the Channel Islands				
	3) Shipping Lane: Make Voluntary Western Lane an Official TSS				
	4) Shipping Lane: Bathymetric Feature Avoidance				
	5) SMA – VSR Seasonal Inside and Outside Channel				
	6) DMA- AIS Whale Warning Zone				
	7) Multi-part Management – Area of Interest, DMA, SMA, TSS Shipping Lane				
	8) Speed Reduction Zone – VSR				