

**Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary  
Sanctuary Advisory Council**

**Final Key Meeting Outcomes  
January 20, 2012  
Casa Las Palmas, Santa Barbara, CA**

*Note: This document will be posted on line at <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/minutes.html>. Audio recordings of this and other Council meetings are available upon request to [michael.murray@noaa.gov](mailto:michael.murray@noaa.gov).*

**Attendance:** At peak, seventeen of the Council's twenty-one voting seats were present (see attached attendance roster). Four seats were absent for the day: California Resources Agency, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Chumash Community, and Ventura County. Public attendance varied from 4 to 10 people.

**Administrative Business and Announcements**

The draft key outcomes report from the November 18, 2011 meeting were adopted as final, with one correction to the attendance list.

The council welcomed a new member for the California Coastal Commission seat, Dr. Jonna Engel. Sarah Wilken was in attendance for the National Marine Fisheries Service.

***Superintendent's Report***

Superintendent Chris Mobley provided a verbal Superintendent's Report. Chris announced that he will be attending a meeting in Galveston, Texas for a gathering of the leadership team of the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries to discuss how to reach a larger audience and how to focus the national program on the right issues. Chris announced that there is an amendment to the existing sanctuary overflight regulation in place for four national marine sanctuaries, including CINMS. A Final Rule was in clearance and is expected to be final soon. The amendment provides a slight change to the wording so that the Federal Aviation Administration can publish the regulation on the aeronautical charts, thus raising awareness and improving enforceability. Chris also reported that there was a boat grounding at Santa Barbara Island over the Christmas holiday causing concern about nearby sea lion haulouts. The boat broke up and spilled some gasoline but there were no human casualties. Chris stated that the research department has been active in publishing and presenting research. Chris introduced Sara Hutto, the new California State Sea Grant Fellow at CINMS. She is working with the resource protection team and will be working on the ship strike issue and other issues. Mike Murray added that all SAC representatives are invited to a volunteer recognition dinner on Thursday January 26<sup>th</sup>, 2012 and are asked to RSVP today. Mike also announced that all SAC representatives will be invited to participate in a survey for a PhD project by Lauren Garske who is exploring how science is used by Advisory Councils

***Council Member Announcements***

A number of Council members shared announcements (unrelated to meeting agenda items). Audio recordings are available upon request.

**Marine Protected Areas (MPAs): Announcements, Education & Outreach, Socioeconomic Studies**

***Announcement: New state MPAs take effect in southern California***

Marija Vojkavich, Marine Region Manager with the California Department of Fish and Game (DFG), announced that the new south coast MPAs took effect on January 1, 2012. Marija reported that they have been emphasizing education and outreach in this region because it is so heavily populated. She said this outreach includes information on DFG websites providing locations, boundaries, and regulations. In addition, there is a mobile phone app that has been well received and they have put up posters and flyers at launch ramps and

harbors. Marija reported that DFG has distributed press releases and they are planning a booklet for the south coast MPAs. Marija stated that they will be using the MarineBIOS program as a web viewer. Marija recognized that they have had a very productive partnership with the National Parks, National Marine Sanctuary, and State Parks in sharing information, and with non-governmental organizations (NGOs) such as Ocean Conservancy and the Orange County Marine Protection Areas Council. Marija reported that some groups have been acting on their own and have provided inaccurate information but DFG is unaware of who has been providing this misinformation.

Greg Helms added that some of the local NGOs have been providing citizen outreach and data collection, in particular Santa Barbara Channelkeeper (SBCK). SBCK has worked with DFG to create a new product to be used by boaters. The council engaged in a discussion about the citizen data collection efforts. A council member described an unpleasant encounter he had with volunteers on the beach.

When asked about how the new MPAs affect scientific collecting permits, Marija indicated that there is a new initiative to restructure the process. Marija said they will be evaluating how much and what kind of research is appropriate to take place within a marine reserve. Marija explained that the process will not be completed quickly but it is a high priority.

#### ***Coordination of MPA education and outreach***

Julie Bursek, CINMS Team Leader for Education and Outreach, reviewed the role of the CINMS education department in supporting the Channel Islands MPA. This has included been focused on increasing awareness, developing effective communications, and creating a sense of ownership and stewardship. Julie reviewed a timeline of the process to develop a plan and products since 2001. Julie described how they worked with many partners to develop a consistent message and visual products, including multiple brochures, posters, a website, and signs. Julie said that over the past 10 years she estimates they have invested \$850,000. Julie stated that the current CINMS products do not include the new mainland MPA sites but they will need to consider this as they develop new products. Julie described recent efforts between CINMS, CDFG, Channel Islands National Park, and others to review coordination of MPA outreach. Julie reported that these partners decided to develop a guidance document, a message document, and to review the next version of the DFG MPA booklet for 2012 regulations. Julie described some of the efforts of partners including: targeted boater outreach by Channel Islands National Park, Underwater Parks Day by Ty Warner Sea Center, Youth Outreach by Wishtoyo Foundation, Volunteer MPA outreach training programs (such as those by Santa Barbara Channelkeeper, Heal the Bay, Ocean Conservancy), and MPA outreach signs and products.

The council discussed options for on-the-water identification of boundaries, such as buoys or photos that help a boater identify locations of prohibited activities. Julie recalled that the council has previously discussed buoys or range markers and determined that at the Channel Islands they are not as viable as education materials. Marija reminded the council that consumptive users need to be conservative (about MPA boundaries) if they are unsure of rules and boundaries. Phyllis Grifman recognized the leadership that CINMS and the council has shown in developing consistent products and she offered her education staff person, Linda Chilton, to help with this effort. Michael Sheehy said that there are state MPA products for all of the subregions on the south coast that his organization has helped develop. Merit McCrea said that the most helpful product has been a cell phone app but it is only useful in cell phone range. Merit recommended that hard copy maps can be the most useful, along with use of a GPS and coordinates. Bruce Steele made some recommendations for a hard copy map that would be clearer and he identified a phone app glitch. Mike Murray summarized some of the recommendations and a few council members volunteered to help the SET as they develop and improve products.

#### ***Presentation on CINMS MPA socioeconomic study results “Testing for an MPA Effect: Analysis of recreational vessel observation data collected in the California Channel Islands”***

Chris LaFranchi reported on his project that examined 5 years of data collected before and 5 years of data collected after the designation of MPAs at the islands from the Sanctuary Aerial Monitoring Spatial Analysis Program (SAMSAP). LaFranchi stated that they looked at the aerial vessel data for patterns of spatial use, and

frequency of use, of consumptive and non-consumptive vessels. LaFranchi described the characteristics of the data used. The council engaged in a discussion on how vessels and activities are identified and recorded and Natalie Senyk was able to answer many of the council's questions on the SAMSAP methodology. LaFranchi's data was presented as the distance from a MPA edge of different categories of vessels. LaFranchi emphasized that the analysis was designed to look simply at changes in the pattern in vessel distribution over time. The council engaged in a lengthy and somewhat heated discussion about the analysis, the use and accuracy of the analysis, and the details of the study. Commercial and Recreational Fishing seats in particular raised concerns about how the data will be used. Phyllis Grifman added the perspective that scholarly work is extensively peer-reviewed before used by the management community. The council discussed their level of confidence in the study but was reminded that they are not being asked to take council action with regard to this preliminary work.

***Proposed UCSB/Bren School socioeconomic research project on non-consumptive use of the sanctuary***

Kiya Gornik and Brandon Doheny provided a description of their proposed project, including what data is available for them to use, what kind of model they will use to analyze the data, and potential ways the data could be used, including informing managers and stakeholders. Chris LaFranchi added that although this study was proposed before, the investigators used their resources to collect data and did not have funding and time to complete the analysis. The council engaged in a discussion about the distinction between consumptive and non-consumptive activities and how that would be handled in the survey. The council discussed the peer review process and how this proposal may benefit from peer review during the course of the study, analysis, and reporting. Council members also discussed perception of bias in the way MPA projects are conducted and perceived. The Council moved to consideration of the letter. Edits included changing "high priority" to "important" indicating the value the SAC has placed on socio-economic monitoring. The council voted 16-1 to support the letter with these changes.

**Public comment**

Chris Goldblatt spoke about the loss of fishing and diving access at Paradise Cove from the new state MPA designation. He suggested that fishermen should be employed for enforcement, and that subsistence harvest should be allowed, such as spearfishing/freediving, but with no motoring in to the MPA, no use of SCUBA, and a catch limit of two of anything.

Michael Sheehy from Santa Barbara Channelkeeper spoke about their "MPA Watch" program, training and deploying volunteers to collect data (not do outreach and enforcement) on the various uses at MPAs.

Paul Petrich spoke about the success of managing the Bristol Bay salmon fishery. He is a volunteer with MPA Watch and has not experienced anything negative while conducting his data surveys.

**New Technologies to Enhance Marine Mammal Sightings Data Collection**

CINMS Physical Scientist Natalie Senyk introduced her talk by emphasizing that marine mammal surveying is a significant effort – over 1,000 sightings are collected each year by a volunteer force. It is a very inefficient effort and results in a significant delay in whale location and abundance information. The process needs to be streamlined. Verizon approached sanctuary staff about any data information needs that may exist and they introduced staff to Groveware Technologies. Natalie described that this company generates e-forms to be used on mobile devices, including phones, blackberries, tablets and iphones, and the company offered pro bono to generate a preliminary e-form for sightings data collection. Currently, 7% of the geographic coordinate data contains errors; this wireless method should reduce that error rate. Two volunteers tested the e-form on a 7-inch and 12-inch tablet loaned to the sanctuary by Verizon. Natalie described further advantages of this software: data can be filtered, the software can automatically send e-mails about certain trigger data, and all data is wirelessly sent, so this would greatly reduce staff effort. Capt. Dick McKenna noted that this technology could be used to generate warnings to ships about whale locations. Natalie mentioned the compatibility of the new data format with existing data spreadsheets and that data can be collected outside the network and then sent once the user returns to network range. She concluded by stating that this is a pilot project for many more potential applications.

### **Ship Traffic Patterns near the Sanctuary**

Natalie Senyk, CINMS Physical Scientist, discussed recent changes in vessel route patterns as a result of recent regulatory changes enacted by the California Air Resources Board. Effective December 1, 2011, the boundary of the low sulfur ship fuel area was extended from 24 nm from the mainland coast to 24 nm from the coast or offshore islands, effectively doubling the distance of the zone in areas adjacent to the Channel Islands. A small area is excluded from this, northwest of the islands, to encourage ships to use the traffic separation scheme (TSS) in the Santa Barbara channel. Natalie presented data that showed that two weeks before this change, the greatest amount of cargo ship traffic occurred south of the islands (to avoid the current fuel regulation area). The two weeks following the regulation implementation, there was an increase in cargo ships using the TSS and the traffic south of the islands decreased and shifted further south (this correlated with the ships avoiding the regulation area, but has not been investigated fully). Natalie's overall message was that increased ship traffic is being observed in the Santa Barbara Channel due to the offshore extension of the regulation area. Capt. Dick McKenna added that the small area left out of the regulation acts as an incentive for ships to use the TSS, so as to avoid conflicts with the Navy's test range south of the northern Channel Islands. He also mentioned that preliminary data indicates that ships use the channel more for arrival and depart south of the islands. Various council members discussed the consequences and implications of this new regulation for safety and marine life. Linda Krop requested that the council hear updates about the PARS study and discuss what the SAC will do about the upcoming whale season. Sarah Wilken mentioned that this data could be useful for NMFS and SWFSC on their PARS commentary.

### **Identification and Prioritization of Council Work Topics for 2012**

Chris Mobley introduced this item by emphasizing that the development of the work plan is an iterative process; the sanctuary staff suggest items that they could use assistance with, and the SAC responds with what they want to help with. The SAC plays a role in helping sanctuary staff to develop innovative ways to accomplish tasks. Chris mentioned big things happening this year: the move to UCSB will be a big force in the sanctuary's life this year, the boating center will provide additional outreach, and the science department is working to determine priorities based on resources available throughout the year. Mike Murray provided overall context to the importance and use of these SAC meetings – staff aim to have 6 productive, useful meetings throughout the year. Staff is here to listen and become better managers based on the quality of discussion amongst council members. Council members can add issues to this work plan; this is a list that the staff finds to be most pressing but likely does not include every important issue.

Mike Murray opened the floor to the council to suggest additions to the work plan. Linda Krop requested that the SAC be informed of what issues the sanctuary staff are working on that are not included in the work plan for council attention. Water quality was requested by Jonna Engel and Linda Krop – Mike replied that nothing new has come up to get SAC advice on. Linda is worried that acoustic impacts were left off the list and if this would send the wrong message to sanctuary program headquarters that it is not important to the SAC. Chris Mobley assured the council that this work plan would not be misconstrued. The council spoke about the state and federal budget, legislation that may impact those budgets, and methods by which the sanctuary can innovate and make the most of resources (i.e. tablets to collect sightings data). Merit suggested making use of internal SAC expertise on artificial reefs.

Several additional suggestions were added to the list of staff ideas, and then Council members individually ranked each idea as "high", "medium" or low". Staff will compile the results later and make the resulting list available on the advisory council web site.

### **Working Group Reports**

#### ***Channel Islands Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) on Enforcement***

Bill Struble briefly mentioned that TAC discussions had been focused on vessel groundings at the islands and the process of making decisions to remove wreckage.

***Sanctuary Education Team (SET)***

Amanda Hendrickson reported on recent SET discussions in response to a request from the SAC that they look into a pilot youth project that would allow for youth involvement with the council. With funding from NOAA's Ocean Guardian Program, a Youth Ocean Stewardship Council can be created. Amanda reported that the idea is to have a high school group apply for funding to attend council meetings and develop their own project. The service project would deal with a SAC issue. The SET has drafted an announcement to be sent to local high schools to encourage them to apply for this opportunity. Mike Murray added that with outside funding, sanctuary staff think this is a great opportunity to pilot youth involvement. The SET was looking for SAC approval to further pursue this opportunity. The SAC approved a motion to support the SET pursuing this further. Amanda also discussed that the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council is sending a letter to NOAA leadership to support NOAA California Bay Watershed Education and Training (B-WET) program; the SET team, with approval from the SAC, would also like to draft a similar SAC letter to be sent to NOAA asking that the program's funding be re-instated. This matter will be addressed in March as a draft proposed letter for council consideration.

***Research Activities Panel (RAP)***

Dr. Robert Warner mentioned that the next RAP meeting will be in late February or early March, and would likely merge with a meeting of the Channel Islands Marine Research Panel.

***Conservation Working Group (CWG)***

Linda Krop reported that at the recent CWG meeting the group discussed the Coast Guard's Port Access Route Study and would like to request that the Coast Guard first consider altering the current TSS in the Santa Barbara Channel before addressing a potential TSS south of the northern Channel Islands. Linda mentioned that the Whales and Shipping workshop presentations are now available on EDC's website, with audio available upon request. Linda reported that the CWG's Offshore Renewable Energy Report is progressing with help from an intern and information from the Ocean Protection Council. The ocean acidification PSA being created by EDC will be available in time for the next SAC Summit [April 9, webinar]; this is an implementation measure from the ocean acidification report. Linda also mentioned a program called Edible Santa Barbara and efforts to incorporate sustainably caught local fish.

**Future Meeting Schedule:**

- Friday March 16, 2012 (Ventura)
- Friday May 18, 2012 (Santa Barbara)
- Friday July 20, 2012 (Ventura)
- Friday September 21, 2012 (Santa Barbara)
- Friday November 16, 2012 (Ventura)

**Meeting Attendance Roster ( ):**

Andrea Mills	Tourism	<i>Absent</i>
Matthew Curto	Tourism - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Debra Herring	Non-Consumptive Recreation	<i>Present</i>
Nicole Peters	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Capt. Richard McKenna	Business	<i>Present</i>
Michael Gould	Business - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Linda Krop	Conservation	<i>Present</i>
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Bruce Steele	Commercial Fishing	<i>Present</i>
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	<i>Present</i>
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Maria Petueli	Education	<i>Absent</i>
Amanda Hendrickson	Education - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	<i>Present</i>
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Phyllis Grifman [Council Secretary]	Public At Large #1	<i>Present</i>
Victor Cox	Public At Large #1 - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Eric Kett [Council Chair]	Public At Large #2	<i>Present</i>
Marilyn Kelly	Public At Large #2 - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Luhui Isha	Chumash Community	<i>Absent</i>
Venisse Miller-Forte	Chumash Community - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
vacant	NOAA Fisheries	---
Elizabeth Petras	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Russell Galipeau	National Park Service	<i>Present</i>
David Ashe	National Park Service - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
CDR Christina Davidson	US Coast Guard	<i>Present</i>
LCDR Elisa Garrity	US Coast Guard – Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Donna Schroeder	BOEM	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Ann Bull	BOEM - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
John Ugoretz	Dept. of Defense	<i>Absent</i>
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Marija Vojkovich	CA Dept. of Fish & Game	<i>Present</i>
Kristine Barsky	CA Dept. of Fish & Game - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
vacant	CA Natural Resources Agency	---
Amy Vierra	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	<i>Present</i>
Steve Hudson	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dianne Black	Santa Barbara County	<i>Present</i>
Susan Curtis	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	<i>Present</i>
Lyn Krieger	Ventura County	<i>Absent</i>
Marilyn Miller	Ventura County - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	<i>Present</i>
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Maria Brown	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Brian Johnson	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>