

# Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary Sanctuary Advisory Council

## FINAL Key Meeting Outcomes September 21, 2012 Casa Las Palmas, Santa Barbara, CA

*Note: This document will be posted on line at <http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/minutes.html>.  
Audio recordings of Council meetings are available upon request to [michael.murray@noaa.gov](mailto:michael.murray@noaa.gov).*

**Attendance:** At peak, sixteen of the Council's twenty-one voting seats were present (see attached attendance roster). Five seats were absent for the day: California Resources Agency, California Coastal Commission, Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Department of Fish and Game, and County of Ventura. Maximum public attendance was 14 people.

### **Administrative Business and Announcements**

The draft key outcomes report from the July 20, 2012 meeting was adopted as final.

#### ***Superintendent's Report***

Superintendent Chris Mobley highlighted several items in the Superintendent's Report (provided to all SAC members and the attending public and available at <http://www.channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/super.html>).

Chris also introduced four guests in attendance: John Armor, Chief of the Conservation and Policy Planning Division (CPPD) at NOAA's Office of National Marine Sanctuaries; LeAnn Hogan, new staff on detail with CPPD; Harry Rabin, Channel Islands Sanctuary Foundation board liaison; and Dan Richards with the Channel Islands National Park, who is retiring from a distinguished career with the National Park Service. Chris Mobley presented Dan Richards with a gift to honor his 30 years of service to Channel Islands National Park and his dedication to the study and protection of marine resources.

In addition, Chris recognized the National Marine Sanctuary System's 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary and the advisory council's recent Environmental Stewardship award from Santa Barbara Beautiful. Finally, Chris noted that NOAA's 10-knot ship speed recommendation for the Santa Barbara Channel area was recently lifted due to a seasonal decline in whale observations.

#### ***Council Member Announcements***

A number of Council members shared announcements (unrelated to meeting agenda items). Audio recordings are available upon request.

#### **Increasing Sanctuary Visibility and Marketability: Subcommittee Report**

Mike Murray, CINMS Deputy Superintendent for Programs, provided a progress report on the council's new Subcommittee, which will focus on enhancing the visibility and marketability of the sanctuary. He first reminded the council of why and how the subcommittee was convened, who the members are, and what was discussed at the group's first meeting, which included the basic status of the sanctuary budget, resources, programs, and approaches, the consideration of a goal for the subcommittee, and the key elements that members felt were essential for successful marketing, specifically in a situation where resources are tight. Decisions regarding the possibility of the group becoming a council working group, Chair nomination, and naming of the group were deferred until the following meeting. For the next meeting, Subcommittee members requested that sanctuary staff provide detailed information regarding current programs, web visitation statistics, the role of the sanctuary foundation, and sanctuary presence in the community.

Eric Kett added that the meeting went very well and noted that the topics presented in the notes from the meeting will be valuable to him when he attends the annual national SAC Summit this December in Santa Cruz. Michael Cohen mentioned that key goals still need to be specifically defined, and that members had many

valuable ideas. Richard Block mentioned that there are many opportunities for partnerships and community outreach. Bruce Steele added that the Subcommittee might also want to consider the importance and value of translating outreach materials into foreign languages.

### **Informational Presentation: “Characterizing Baseline Conditions in Rocky Intertidal Ecosystems of Southern California” by Dr. Carol Blanchette**

Sara Hutto introduced Dr. Carol Blanchette, Research Biologist at the Marine Science Institute, UC Santa Barbara. Dr. Blanchette spoke to the council about her work with PISCO, the Partnership for Interdisciplinary Studies of Coastal Oceans, and began with an overview of MPAs in Southern California and the California Marine Life Protection Act (MLPA). She provided background on the MPA network that was adopted for the south coast region, and explained that the South Coast MPA Baseline program is intended to “provide a summary of ecological and socioeconomic conditions” inside and outside of marine protected areas in the region. Dr. Blanchette introduced the South Coast MPA baseline projects, which can be found at oceanspaces.org. She also explained that rocky intertidal habitats can be heavily impacted by humans. She introduced the goals and objectives of the baseline projects, which are to produce a quantitative baseline characterization of the structure of rocky intertidal ecosystems (RIEs), and provide a quantitative comparison between the RIEs in MPAs and reference areas. Dr. Blanchette explained the monitoring methods including biodiversity surveys and targeted species sampling and noted that they are seeing shifts in biodiversity. She explained the bioregions chosen for sampling and noted that they tried to sample from areas with different conditions. She also explained how the project is assessing focal species such as owl limpets and mussels. She introduced LiMPETS (the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries’ Long-term Monitoring Program & Experiential Training for Students), explained long term monitoring and outreach efforts, and reported that they will be comparing LiMPETS data sets to their own. Dr. Blanchette noted that she values outreach and education as much as she values research. The data and findings will be made available to the public.

Capt. David Bacon discussed the socioeconomic adverse impacts of MPAs, pointing out that media statements made even before MPA designations were finalized damaged the recreational fishing industry. He suggested that it would be better to examine socioeconomic baselines two to three years before the implementation of MPAs, before damage is done during the designation process.

### **Sanctuary Classic Fishing and Photography Tournament: Wrap-Up Report**

Shauna Bingham, CINMS volunteer and outreach coordinator, introduced Jenny Armstrong and Tom Raftican with the Sportfishing Conservancy. Ms. Armstrong provided a presentation (slides available upon request) about the tournament’s recently completed first season. She showed videos (available on [sanctuaryclassic.org](http://sanctuaryclassic.org)) from tournament events held at the Monterey Bay, Florida Keys, and Gray’s Reef national marine sanctuaries. Ms. Armstrong explained that the goals of the Sanctuary Classic were to support sustainable fishing practices, but also to demonstrate that the sanctuaries are open to the public for fishing, and are not off limits. Approximately 150 photos were submitted over the course of the summer, and she mentioned that the most were submitted from people fishing within the CINMS. Ms. Armstrong announced the winners, showing their winning photos. Mr. Raftican thanked many individuals involved in the Classic and emphasized how the contest had facilitated the interaction between the recreational fishing community and the sanctuaries. Mr. Raftican asked council members to please consider writing letters of support, as he will be trying to hold the tournament next year as well.

### **Public Comment**

Paul Petrich described the successful work that the Channel Islands Naturalist Corps has been doing with State Parks, mentioning the popular campfire talk program. He recommended that State Parks be approached as a valuable partner.

### **Informational Presentation: Fish movements and habitat use relative to marine protected area design and efficacy**

Sara Hutto introduced Dr. Chris Lowe, Professor of Biological Sciences at California State University Long Beach. Dr. Lowe spoke to the council about his work on fish movement and habitat use in relation to marine protected areas. Dr. Lowe explained how measurements are taken for monitoring MPAs and fish. Although one of the hardest things to monitor is fish movement, Dr. Lowe explained that there are new tools – but they are expensive. For example, telemetry, satellite transmitters, GPS technology, spatial analysis, GIS, coupled with better oceanographic data. Dr. Lowe explained that with active tracking, a transmitter is placed on an animal and followed by a boat. This is being done with high resolution to help determine habitats preferences. With passive tracking, he explained transmitters can last up to 10 years, receivers are placed underwater to do the tracking, and there is a lower resolution. Dr. Lowe then described work at a Catalina Island study site that used both techniques. With this study, the home ranges were tracked for different species, as well as the time spent outside marine reserves, and the distance traveled outside the reserve. Dr. Lowe found that the quality of habitat affected the home range, and that habitat preferences could differ between day and night. This type of information can be useful for MPA boundary placement. With active tracking evaluated over short time ranges, Dr. Lowe explained that some species show site fidelity, while others may have settled in ranges outside the MPA. He also translocated fish to see how fast they would return to their home range. Some returned in hours, others in months. Some habitat breaks serve as barriers to long term dispersal. Dr. Lowe also described “VPS” techniques used to accurately triangulate fish positions, as well as methods to use as a predictive tool that could explain when fish will migrate. Dr. Lowe also talked about the use of Autonomous Underwater Vehicles (AUVs) with imaging sonar to count individuals, and mentioned an NSF grant to build an autonomous robot for tracking sharks. With these types of tools a gap in MPA science concerning mile species (e.g., white seabass) can begin to be evaluated. Council questions involved topics such as the challenge of understanding mobile species relative to MPAs, how to use these tracking tools without altering animal behavior, and how to pick appropriate study control sites.

### **Informational Presentation: Student shark science project, in collaboration with Dr. Chris Lowe at the CSULB Shark Lab**

Four students from Oak Park High School, with their teacher Dr. Victor Anderson, presented an entertaining educational video that they had created about their work to increase awareness about shark finning and the pervasive population decline of sharks worldwide. As part of their project, the students had learned from Dr. Chris Lowe. Each student spoke briefly after the video regarding their experience during the project. Council members enjoyed the video and discussion followed regarding messaging. Some council members pointed out that shark finning is banned federally as is shark fin trade in California, and offered suggestions about being careful with characterizing international fishing problems as being present everywhere. Council members thanked the students for their good work.

### **Updates on Ocean Acidification and Hypoxia**

Bruce Steele began by describing what has become a seasonal annual cycle of hypoxic conditions off the Oregon and Washington coasts, noting that while he was at the recent west coast regional SAC chairs meeting he was receiving emails that hypoxic nearshore conditions had just been detected by researchers in the Pacific northwest. He played a PISCO video ([www.piscoweb.org/node/394](http://www.piscoweb.org/node/394)) while he talked about hypoxia, noting that he thought sanctuaries should be networked together on this issue, as with ocean acidification. Chris Mobley noted that the education coordinators are well-linked between sanctuaries, and, responding to Bruce, also mentioned that discussing climate change and ocean acidification in the context of human health could be effective. Eric Kett and Sara Hutto passed around an agenda for the upcoming *Best Practices for Communicating Ocean Acidification* workshop in Monterey. Attendees will report on the workshop to the SAC after the event. Mike Murray mentioned (on behalf of Dani Lipski, Sanctuary Research Specialist) new efforts by west coast sanctuaries to build an OA monitoring program inventory. Eric Kett asked Bruce Steele for his views on what we can personally do about something like ocean acidification. Bruce responded that it is difficult to have hope in seeing the kind of reductions in CO<sub>2</sub> output levels we’d need, and talked about his own personal efforts to reduce his carbon footprint as a farmer and fisherman, and his interest in working to help

each other at a local level. Mati Waiya commented on his work with youth, the importance of empowering the youth to make changes, and the importance of what he and other indigenous people have been taught about how to live sustainably off the land.

### **Ship Traffic Monitoring Near CINMS**

Sean Hastings, CINMS Resource Protection Coordinator, presented to the council on seasonal ship traffic monitoring and whale sightings (slides available upon request). Sean explained that the industry was interested in seeing the voluntary slow speed zone within the Santa Barbara Channel reduced in size. This was done this season, Sean explained, but still ships were not observed to have reduced speed. Many vessels are still transiting south of the islands, in addition to the route through the channel. Whale sightings this year were concentrated to the west of the shipping lanes, north of eastern Santa Rosa Island and western Santa Cruz Island, and by mid-September, sightings had decreased dramatically, suggesting that feeding whales had moved on from the area.

Sean also reported on efforts to obtain support for the idea of using California state cap and trade funds to support a program that would incentivize slower ship speeds. He spoke about the advisory council's previously-submitted letter of support for this effort. Sean reported on the International Maritime Organization's process to approve the proposal to shift the Santa Barbara Channel southbound shipping lane 1 nautical mile north. Estimated implementation is July of next year. Eric Kett asked if there is compliance with low sulfur fuel regulations. Dick McKenna responded that the southern route shift is a result of compliance with the California Air Resources Board low sulfur fuel regulation. He further reported that the transportation industry has reduced emissions by 70%, and also mentioned that the Marine Exchange of Southern California is now 100% solar. Elizabeth Petras reported on the ship strike meeting with other Sanctuaries. She also discussed the unpredictability of whale distribution.

Eric Kett reported on a recent meeting hosted by the Santa Barbara Air Pollution Control District at which John Calambokidis was the featured speaker. He discussed John's recent research on whale distribution, behavior, and response to ships.

### **West Coast SAC Chairs Meeting Outcomes and Issues for Council Consideration**

Mike Murray, CINMS Deputy Superintendent for Programs, reported on the west coast SAC Chairs' meeting that he attended with Bruce Steele, who attended for Eric Kett. He described a list of west coast regional priority issues, activities and projects that had presented to the gathering of council chairs, including: whale ship strikes, deep sea coral research cruises, sanctuary overflight rule implementation, introduced species regulation change (at Monterey and Gulf of the Farallones sanctuaries only), boat operation challenges, operating interpretive centers, a new maritime heritage implementation plan, ocean acidification action plan, coordinating spill preparedness, boundary changes proposed for the Monterey Bay NMS, ESA-listed abalone recovery, socioeconomics, the Sanctuary Classic tournament, Unmanned Aerial Vehicles, and management plan 5-year updates. In response to Captain David Bacon asking for a clarification about "increase paid partner days" relative to boat operations, Mike explained that it is in reference to cost sharing arrangements that are possible for certain research projects, often grant funded, that need the unique capabilities of sanctuary research vessels and that have a vessel operations portion of their project budget. Mike also reported that Bill Douros further emphasized the importance of our OA work at all sanctuary sites, and that Bruce Steele's informed and impassioned contributions seemed to be an important part of that. Bruce Steele spoke at the meeting about engaging fisherman with sanctuaries and SACs in a more positive way, emphasizing the importance of focusing on more positive cases of fisheries management that is working well. Mike shared that the comments he and Bruce had received in advance from Captain Bacon regarding recreational fishing interests were read to the meeting participants.

Another meeting highlight Mike shared concerned discussions about the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries "Site Evaluation List" and interest in reactivating it so as to allow communities around the nation an opportunity to have candidate sites of interest evaluated for possible future inclusion within the sanctuary system. Mike

passed around some letters that other west coast SACs had recently written to express support to NOAA for the reactivation of the site evaluation list, but also explained that it was the opinion of the council's Executive Committee that, at this time, taking on letter writing for this purpose would not be worth the anticipated distractions and arguments.

Mike also shared that a recent 90-minute SAC Chairs national conference call was held, with a focus on tourism at national marine sanctuaries. Bruce Steele, who was on that call, explained that he had cautioned about issues such as how increases in tourism brings increases in carbon footprints, and how much of our local sanctuary isn't appropriate for encouraging additional tourism use. Michael Cohen commented on the importance of ecotourism for the local economy and for environmental education. The council discussed this tradeoff. John Ugoretz, commenting on an idea from Eric Kett, supporting the concept of a healthy fish marketing campaign linked to the local sanctuary. Other comments were focused on Bruce's concern about the idea of increased air flights to San Miguel Island, with various views expressed regarding public access, environmental impacts, aesthetics, and cultural heritage sensitivities.

## Working Group Reports

**Channel Islands Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) on Enforcement.** Bill Struble with the NOAA Office of Law Enforcement reported that there have been limited enforcement events locally. Monterey Bay has had an eventful month, however. He reported on the proposed seismic survey in San Luis Obispo and the public comment period. He mentioned the occurrence of humpback lunge feeding in San Luis bay.

**Chumash Community Working Group.** Luhui Isha Ward reported on the passing of members of the Chumash community. She reported on the tomol crossing event earlier in the month, which was dedicated to the women in our lives, including those battling illness. She commented on the great community gathering at Limuw that accompanies the tomol crossing event, and showed pictures. Chris Mobley, who was on one of the safety vessels during the crossing, also commented on the photos and gave an account of the rough weather encountered and the eventual swamping of the tomol *Muptami* and associated successful response to the incident. Luhui Isha and Mati Waiya spoke about some of the lessons learned by the community. Luhui Isha also mentioned the Fall equinox ceremony coming up at the Chumash Discovery Village in Malibu that will be open to the larger community. On behalf of photographer and Maritime Heritage Coordinator Robert Schwemmer of CINMS, Mike Murray presented a gift to Luhui – a photo collage of the tomol crossing.

**Sanctuary Education Team (SET).** Maria Petueli reported on the SET's work with youth and the Oxnard High School Earthbound group. She talked about the process of preparing them to present to the SAC on MPAs. She also reported that Katie Davis (from Citrix Online) is helping to educate students on ocean acidification.

**Commercial Fishing Working Group.** Stephanie Mutz reported on an upcoming seafood series: events that will feature a scientist, a fisherman, and a chef discuss fish from their various perspectives. October 11th will be on abalone and black cod, with spiny lobster coming up.

**Conservation Working Group (CWG).** Greg Helms briefly summarized discussion topics that were covered at the CWG's September 19<sup>th</sup> meeting: the Bren School thesis project on sanctuary use; the ship strike issue; SAC marketing subcommittee, ocean acidification, west coast SAC chairs meeting, national SAC chairs conference call on tourism, and the Sanctuary Classic tournament. (CWG meeting notes available upon request, and will be posted at [channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/wg\\_announce.html](http://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/wg_announce.html)).

## Meeting Close-Out

Eric Kett mentioned some upcoming events: SAC Meeting in Ventura on November 16<sup>th</sup>, and the annual in-person national SAC Summit meeting, this year from December 4-6 in Santa Cruz, California. He also offered a reminder about the public memorial service that afternoon for former SAC member Nicole Peters.

**Meeting Attendance Roster (9/21/2012):**

Andrea Mills	Tourism	Present
Matthew Curto	Tourism - Alternate	Present
Debra Herring	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Present
vacant	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	----
Capt. Richard McKenna	Business	Present
Michael Cohen	Business - Alternate	Present
Linda Krop	Conservation	<i>Absent</i>
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	Present
Bruce Steele	Commercial Fishing	Present
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	Present
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Present
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Maria Petueli	Education	Present
Amanda Hendrickson	Education - Alternate	Present
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	Present
Phyllis Grifman [Council Secretary]	Public At Large #1	<i>Absent</i>
Victor Cox	Public At Large #1 - Alternate	Present
Eric Kett [Council Chair]	Public At Large #2	Present
Richard Block	Public At Large #2 - Alternate	Present
Luhui Isha	Chumash Community	Present
Mati Waiya	Chumash Community - Alternate	Present
vacant	NOAA Fisheries	----
Elizabeth Petras	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	Present
Russell Galipeau	National Park Service	<i>Absent</i>
Dan Richards	National Park Service - Alternate	Present
CDR Christina Davidson	US Coast Guard	Present
LCDR Brad Soule	US Coast Guard - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Donna Schroeder	Bureau of Ocean Energy Mgmt (BOEM)	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Ann Bull	BOEM - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
John Ugoretz	Dept. of Defense	Present
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	Present
Paul Hamdorf	CA Dept. of Fish & Game	<i>Absent</i>
Kristine Barsky	CA Dept. of Fish & Game - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
vacant	CA Natural Resources Agency	----
Amy Vierra	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	<i>Absent</i>
Steve Hudson	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Dianne Black	Santa Barbara County	Present
Susan Curtis	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	Present
Lyn Krieger	Ventura County	<i>Absent</i>
Marilyn Miller	Ventura County - Alternate	<i>Absent</i>
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Present
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Maria Brown	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>
Brian Johnson	Gulf of the Farallones NMS [non-voting]	<i>Absent</i>